

## A CRITICAL ANALYSIS OF WITTER BYNNER'S "A NIGHT MOORING NEAR MAPLE BRIDGE"

ARTHUR E. KUNST

The problems of translating poetry are many and they are notorious. If we suspect that wide differences in language, culture and taste make their mark upon poetry, then the problems of translating Asian poetry ought to be stupefying. Yet countless delighted and energetic souls, from the first European explorations of Asia, have done their best to bring that poetry into Western experience. At present one can hardly open a literary quarterly without seeing some gesture toward the lyric modes of China or Japan. Very often these gestures are in the form of imitations, of versions, of translations.

If we are puzzled and perplexed when it comes to evaluating the translation of poetry in a European context—many of us are not longer puzzled: "poetry cannot be translated," we declare, calmly and sadly—how much more puzzled we have to be when it comes to evaluating translation from one of the classical literatures of the East. What I wish to do in this paper is to report on an experiment, an experiment in translation criticism. I think there is a need for experimental ventures in this area; one has only to look at the deplorable cruelty of translation reviewers—a cruelty to the translator and a cruelty to the original writer. Translators are dismissed with a sentence, their effort to make a real English poem all over again out of materials from another tradition is waved aside in a few references to "reads well" and "generally accurate but on page 36, can he have mistaken *dušt* (caviar) for *mušt* (cowdung)?" And then the critic goes on, probably harassed himself, to dismiss all the complexity of the original by passing on to the next book or the next poem. I would like to try the opposite approach, if you will: to study in detail both what can be discerned in the original and what can be seen in the translation. I don't think this experiment can provide the answer to the question of what a translation can be vis à vis an original. But I would like to suggest by example some of the approaches which could be made to a fair evaluation of the translator's job. One wants to know both what could have been done and what has been done.

The subject of the study is a poem by 張繼 Zhāng Jì (Chang Chi) 楓橋夜泊 Fēng Qiáo Yè Pó (or according to the reconstructions of Karlgren and others, Vūng G'yēu Yā B'qk) and its English version, as done by Witter Bynner and Kiang Kang-hu<sup>1</sup>. I shall not weary you with the extraordinary amount of factual information that can be gleaned from a four-line poem and a title. As an experiment,

we have to be interested primarily in method—even though the results often seemed to me quite interesting in themselves.

The first step, I believe (following J. C. Catford [*A Linguistic Theory of Translation*]), for the translation critic must be to classify the elements of the passage according to their functions within the levels of linguistic and poetic analysis—phonetic, graphic, grammatical, semantic, from one's linguistic assumptions; and prosodic, visual, thematic, and narrative, depending on one's poetic assumptions. Each unit may have several roles to play: a word, for example, may take part in a grammatical structure, a pattern of imagery, a string of similar consonants, and an underlining of mood. In order to discover this multiple functioning of the unit, I have found it best to follow a procedure something like this:

1. Identification.

- a. Classification of the levels of language or poetry present in the sample.
- b. Classification of terms by function within one level, taking one level at a time.
- c. Marking the boundaries of functional units within each level, and superimposition of the boundary patterns on one diagram.
- d. Estimate of the relative conventionality of the sample on any level, both to the language as a whole and to any known artistic conventionalities.

2. Statistical Analysis.

- a. Counting the total number of functional units (say, *lines* or */pak/* sounds), of classes of units (say, *nouns* or *metaphors*), or of contingencies (units often occurring in close proximity): i. e., frequency.
- b. Distribution of frequent units in terms of the total number of units at the same level or in the same class, expressed as a percentage.
- c. Classification by order of frequency and by distribution.

3. Sequential Analysis.

- a. Giving each unit a number in a sequence of units at the same level.
- b. Noting cycles or clusters of similar units along the sequence, i. e., density.
- c. Noting the distance of units from the boundaries of units in the same linguistic or poetic level, and from the superimposed boundaries of all units. (I think that as a general rule, the more boundaries occurring at one place in the sequence, the higher the contrast for any unit adjacent to that boundary.)

That constitutes the general method I have used: identification of what I believed to be present, a search for patterns of repetition and of rhythm. In order to be less abstract, I will proceed to report some of the more fruitful consequences of the research into "A Night-Mooring at Maple Bridge."

Dealing with the level of sound is always hard for the critic of written verse. It is more difficult in Chinese, where the writing system is open to many modern

pronunciations, none of which match the peculiar system employed by the literati of the early T'ang dynasty. Nevertheless, one would be foolhardy to ignore the long and productive connections between verse and song in classical China. One of the first things noticeable about the poem is that it is written to conform most precisely with an essentially musical or prosodic form, the 絕句 Jue-ju. Since I am just as curious to discover the ways in which the poem structures its own individual music as to know the ways in which it conforms to poetic usage, I have tried to reconstruct a T'ang court pronunciation of the poem during the first centuries of the dynasty<sup>2</sup>.

Vūng G'yēu Yā B'p̄k

Nggyw̄t lək 'ūo d'iēi shyāng mbuān tiēn  
 gyoāng vūng nggywō huá duài zh'yəu mbien  
 gūo sūo řyēng ngguai ġān shān szī  
 yā buān jywōng xyēng dàu kāk j'ywēn

Fēng Qiáo Yè Pó

Yuè luò, wū tí, shuāng mǎn tiān.  
 Jiāng fēng yú huǒ duì chóu mián.  
 Gū Sū chéng wài Hán Shān sì  
 Yè bàn zhōng shēng dào kè chuán.

Zhāng Jì

What we have here is, above, the reconstruction of the older pronunciation, and below, a version according to modern spoken standards. I have tried to make the spelling of the T'ang pronunciation as close as possible to the rules for the spelling of modern standard Chinese, but of course there are far more vowel sounds than can be accommodated easily onto a modern typewriter.

The conventional prosody calls for a sequence of seven-word lines, each word euphoniously matched to a neighbors by a pattern of tones. The eight tones are divided into *level*<sup>(2)</sup> and *oblique*<sup>(6)</sup>, and the convention assigns level or oblique tones to most of the positions in the poem (Chart 1 and 2).

Chart 1.

CONVENTIONAL  
TONES

Level —  
Oblique |

		a	b	c	d		
1	2						
			—	—			
8	9						
			—			—	—
15	16						
			—		—	—	
22	23						
				—			—

Chart 2.

ACTUAL  
TONES

Level —  
Oblique |

		a	b	c	d		
1	2						
		—	—				
8	9						
—	—	—			—	—	
15	16						
—	—	—		—	—		
22	23						
		—	—			—	

Zhang's poem is conventionally perfect, to what was still a relatively fresh convention. However, where the poem has a choice (in theory), Zhang's poem tends to opt for rows of even tones (see 7, 8, 9, 10 and 13, 14, 15, 16, 17): this may prepare for the even tones of *jiwōng xyēng* (bell sound) in the final line. I chose to differentiate between upper and lower tones, and between different sorts of oblique tones [in the spelled transcription the upper tones are marked above the vowel and the lower tones, below the vowel; rising, falling, and stopped tones are marked diagrammatically]. Although there was no pattern of rising or falling tones, say, that might not occur in any sample of the classical language, there were some sequences of upper (7, 8, 9 and especially 23, 24, 25, 26, 27) and lower tones (b, c, d, 1, 2) that seemed to stand out as musical. (Chart 3).

Chart 3.

TONES		Chart 3.						
		a	b	c	d			
1	2	3	4	5	6	7		
8	9	10	11	12	13	14		
15	16	17	18	19	20	21		
22	23	24	25	26	27	28		

And, combining upper-lower and even-oblique contrasts, there are a few contingency patterns (8-9: 15-16: 24-25 or c-d: 1-2 and a-b: 3-4). Furthermore, convention dictates a rhyme in position 14 and 28 (and, if possible, position 7): again Zhang's poem is conventionally up-to-date.

I examined the patterns of internal consonant, vowel, diphthong or consonant cluster rhyme. Some distinct patterns turned up (u in 9, 11, 12, 13, 15, 16, 18 or glottals in a, b, 1, 5, 8, 8, 9, 10, 15, 17, 18, 24, 25) that had to be dismissed on the grounds of general random probability. The presence of d, u, a in 12 and 26 becomes noteworthy only when we superimpose phonetic on grammatical patterns;

and the strong presence of nasals (a, 1, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 14, 14, 17, 18, 19, 20, 23, 24, 25, 28) is warranted only if we associate nasal sounds with the sonority of a bell. Also in the “bell” series is the sequence 17-23-24-28 (řyḡng-jywōng-xyēng-j’ywḡn). The relationship of the two names, Gūo Sūo and Gan Shān, in the third line is also musical emphasis for a nonmusical parallel.

One might think, then, glancing at the Bynner poem, that although it is very smooth and palatable in sound, it is certainly not conventional and probably can’t afford to play up the position that music plays in the original.

Witter Bynner & Kiang Kang-Hu:

A NIGHT MOORING NEAR MAPLE BRIDGE

While I watch the moon go down, a crow caws through the frost;  
 Under the shadows of maple-trees a fisherman moves with his torch;  
 And I hear, from beyond Su-chou, from the temple on Cold Mountain;  
 Ringing for me, here in my boat, the midnight bell.

I don’t find it easy to state what is conventional in twentieth century English verse, but I do strongly suspect that prosodic form has a lot to do with the Bynner’s translations. Both in words (13-12-13-10) and in syllables (13-17-16-12), neither of which are traditional English metres, Bynner’s lines fail to be regular. But in stress-patterns and in foot-patterns the lines are quite formal or at least balanced. Using my dialect and the Wisconsin dialect as a test, I think I have found that the four lines are regulated by equal stress rules. Since stress is regulated to some extent by grammar and punctuation, this cannot vary indefinitely with different American readers. At any rate, the English poem can be charted like this (Chart 4). Please note that there are four primary stresses in each line (even in the last line, whose short word length is strung out by an odd grammar and punctuational pauses). Note, too, that total stresses in each line comes to six or seven, depending on how you treat the initial syllable. And, as one might expect in English verse, primary stress is given to the last word in each line (with a masculine stress on the end of lines 1, 2, and 4). Lines one and two are almost exactly parallel in the sequence of stresses through each.

Regular English verse ruled according to feet is always somewhat irregular; that is, iambic pentameter won’t be invariably iambic or pentameter, and if it is, it’s not conventional English poetry. The rhythmic units analogous to feet in Bynner (and in other modern poets) are a little longer than the normal foot. One can mark off Bynner’s poem according to the *long-and-short* principle of nineteenth-century feet, but this obscures that it does have metrical patterns (Chart 5).



Each of the grammatical halves of line one is parallel to the metrical format of a half of line two. The first half in each line is the reverse of the second half. Line three, I think, is made up of three grammatical parts, each one longer than the preceding, and metrically expanding it. Line four is divided into three equal, grammatical parts, the first two of which are exactly similar, and the last of which finally settles down into iambs.

## Metre by Long Feet

## Line One:

/ x / x / x /

x / / x x /  
(x / x / x /)

## Line Two:

/ xx / xx / x /

x / xx / xx /

## Line Three:

/ x /

(x x /)

x x / x /

x x / x /

x x / x / x / x

x x / x / x / x

## Line Four:

/ x x /

/ x x /

x / x /

## Recurring series:

c-d-e-f; 28-32; 42-47 / x x / x /

29-32; 33-36; 43-47 x x / x /

(also c-f; 16-19)

We may say then that Bynner's poem makes a typically modern effort to translate the conventional and personal verse of the Chinese into a modern English rhythm. On the other hand, I could find nothing comparable in assonance and alliteration to answer to the formalization of tones in the original: I suspect that we should not look at the equivalent level (prosody to prosody) here, but that compensation might occur at a level with equal linguistic inevitability (grammar, or visual design). Of course, Bynner does have sensitivity to phonetic patterns (lines three and four are replete with nasal sounds; we get frequent series like "and-beyond-mountain" or "maple-temple" or "in my-midnight"). The poem is just too short to properly set out a panoply of English sounds.

I prefer not to attribute any visual patterns to the Chinese: a single line, undifferentiated from prose, unpunctuated, two characters repeated from title into poem, the so-called radicals not really serving as visual markers to an educated Chinese reader. What is striking about the Chinese is its contrast to English: extremely varied visual units and extremely homogenous overall appearance.



Whereas the English has spaces at uneven points in the sequence, the lines are pulled apart onto separate planes, torn up in the interior by punctuation marks at odd intervals, and rung up and down from lower case to capital letters. All of which, like all of the Chinese, is very conventional.

By convention, the grammar of the *jue-ju* runs in pairs of parallel lines, one and two, and three and four. In practice, the grammar will show pauses or junctures after each second and fourth word, and each line will be an end-stopped line. Zhang's lines are end-stopped and properly broken up, but the parallelism is notably incomplete: (Chart 6).

Chart 6.

		a	b	c	d		
GRAMMATICAL PARALLELISM							
1	Yuè Moon	2	luò Set	3	wú Crow	4	tí Caw
				5	shuang Frost	6	mǎn Full
8	Jiāng River	9		10	yú Fisher	11	
				12		13	chóu Sad
						14	mián Sleep
15	Gū Soo-	16	Sū Chow	17	chéng City	18	wài Outside
				19	lǎn (Cold) Han-	20	Shān (Mountain) Shān
						21	sì Monastery
22	Yè Night-	23	bàn Mid	24	zhōng Bell	25	shēng Sound
						26	
						27	kè Traveller
						28	chuán Boat

Other parallelisms, not required, seem to make up for the lost ones:

### Parallels

1-2: 3-4

Yuè luò: wū tí

Moon Set: Crow Caw

a-b: 8-9: 10-11: 27-28: 24-25

Fēng Qiáo: Jiāng fēng: Yú huò:

Maple Bridge: River Maples: Fisher

Fires:

Kè chuán: Zhōng shēng

Traveller Boat: Bell Sound

12-14: 26-28

Dui mián: Dào chuán

Toward Sleep: Toward Boat

15-16-17: 19-20-21: 22-23-24

Gū Sū chéng: Hán Shān sì: Yè bàn  
zhōngSoochow city: Hanshan monastery:  
Midnight bell

## In Bynner

Line One: I watch the moon go down

Line Three  
and Four: I hear...ringing, the midnight bell  
(I hear the midnight bell ringing)

Line One: A crow caws through the frost

Line Two: A fisherman moves with his torch

Line Three: from....Su-chou  
from....Cold Mountain

Title: Night-mooring

Title: Maple Bridge

Line Two: Maple-trees

Line Four: Midnight Bell

?: The moon go down (the sky)

A fisherman moves (on the earth)

Categorizing the grammatical functions of Classical Chinese has never been easy. I limit myself here to marking distinctions between noun-like, verb-like, and modifier-like functions. The first line is made up of three clauses (1-2; 3-4; 5-6-7); the second line is very hard to construe, but it seems to have only one clause; the third line and the fourth line are closely related, but they could be read as two clauses or as one clause (given the lack of explicit verbals in the third line). Bynner's poem has a similar grammatical structure: two clauses, one clause, and an extended clause. The huge preponderance of noun-functioning words in the Chinese (24 out of 32, or 75%) is not matched by Bynner's nouns, pronouns, and gerunds (22 out of 54, or 40%). Perhaps this is where Bynner's major tribute to English convention occurs: explicit subjects for verbs, enumerative articles for nouns, and directional prepositions for precisioning relationships (11 prepositions alone). The Chinese seems quite precise about objects, the English distracts us from the objects by being precise about number, position, direction, and observer.

The usual translation criticism dwells on the problem of finding word-for-word correspondences at the level of essential semantics. Despite the primitiveness of the notions of meaning and poetic organization which this betrays, it is useful to inquire briefly at the beginning into just what proportion of the words in the original have *any* equivalent at all in the translation. A surprisingly large number do find an analogue in English (25 of 32), and only the above grammatical conventions seriously throw them off balance.

## Word-Level Correspondence

## I. Likely Correspondent (14)

Fēng/Maple  
 Qiáo/Bridge  
 Yè/Night  
 Pó/Mooring  
 Yuè/Moon  
 Wū/Crow  
 Tí/Caws  
 Shuāng/Frost  
 Fēng/Maple-trees  
 Yú/Fisherman  
 Yè/-night  
 Bàn/Mid-  
 Zhōng/Bell  
 Chuán/Boat

## II. Less Likely Correspondent (11)

Luò/Go Down  
 Huǒ/Torch  
 Gū Sū/Su-chou  
 Wài/Beyond  
 Hán Shān/Cold Mountain  
 Sì/Temple  
 Shēng/Ringing  
 Dào/Here  
 Kè/My

## II. No Apparent Correspondent (7)

Mǎn  
 Tiān  
 Jiāng  
 Duì  
 Chóu  
 Mián  
 Chéng

## III. Interpolated Words (29)

A	With
Near	His
While	And
I	I
Watch	Hear
The	From
A	From
Through	The
The	On
Under	For
The	Me
Shadows	In
Of	My
A	The
Moves	

What makes the word-for-word method so primitive is the assumption we generally make nowadays that a poem is a rich complex of overtones, an ingenious tangle of related images and ideas. Until we have a semantic theory with a dictionary modeled like that proposed by Fodor and Katz in their "Structure of a Semantic Theory",<sup>3</sup> we have, I fear, to struggle along on our own individual imaginations. That is, to be able to trace semantic overtones and associations through a discourse, we still have to set up our own semantic categories. (Even a semantic dictionary, of course, would be useful only for purposes of disambiguation within the lexical

system as a whole, and the exploration of poetic imagery demands a more refined group of distinctions.) In any sequence, links and associations between units will not become evident until the appearance of the second link, and the full consequences of interlinking cannot be known until the last word is studied. I have attempted, quite tentatively, to identify and trace the chains of association as they occur in the Chinese poem, how they recur in the English version, and what new chains are added by the alteration of word-level content. I have no doubt that “mnemonic irrelevancies” have crept in, and that many important relationships have been overlooked. What I wish to demonstrate is the necessity for discovering the most populous segment of the level of meaning when one is analyzing a translation. How inadequate to the full power of lyric poetry is the word-for-word understanding!

Under each of the words in the poem, I have listed semantic classes which I felt were the means for associating that word with several other words in the poem. On the appearance of the second link in the chain, I listed all the words belonging to that class and hence to that chain. I have cross-referenced when I thought that later occurrences were significant; and I have listed words in a directly contrasting semantic class as well (with an asterisk). I have not attempted to show the cross-linkages, which occur with great frequency in any complex poem; I simply remind you that they exist with a similar forcefulness.

#### Semantic Classes

##### FENG/MAPLE

[biological] see Crow  
 [shape] see Fire  
 [natural] see Night  
 [season-word] see Frost  
 [overhead] see Moon

##### YE/NIGHT

[dark] see Crow  
 [time] see Moon  
 [rest] see Anchor  
 [the natural]  
 maple, moon, crow, frost, sky, river,  
 maple, fire, mountain; set, cold,  
 sound; fisher; (sky-nature)

##### QIAO/BRIDGE

[across, joining] see River  
 [extension] see Reaches  
 [body of water] see Anchor  
 [travel] see Anchor  
 [construction] see City

##### PO/ANCHOR

[casting anchor] see Boat  
 [travel]  
 bridge, moon-month, troubled sleep;  
 Gu Su—Soochow, Cold Mountain—  
 Han-shan, Han-shan Monastery,  
 Maple Bridge; bell at midnight;  
 traveller—stranger, boat; reaches,  
 outside—beyond; mountain,  
 monastery  
 [rest] night, sleep, (SU), traveller;  
 monastery; \*fisher-fishing, \*fire  
 [water] bridge, river, fisher, Gu Su,  
 boat; \*fire

## YUE/MOON

[overhead]

maple, crow, sky, mountain;

night; \*set

[time]

night, moon-month, set, mid, bell;

frost; reaches; monastery, bell,

traveller; full—the whole

[white] see Frost

[light] see Fire

## WU/CROW

[biological]

maple, fisher, traveller; Han-shan

[dark-black]

night, sad-gloomy; sky; \*moon

\*fire

[overhead] see Moon

## SHUANG/FROST

[white]

moon, cold-wintery; \*night

[harsh]

caw, fire, cold

[cold] see Sky

[season]

maple, crow, sky-nature, fisher—fires,

sad; cold; bell—sound

## TIAN/SKY-AIR

[temperature]

air—weather, frost, cold; night,

midnight; \*fire

[overhead] see Moon

[spatial]

full—throughout; (objects with background, e. g., traveller-in-boat-in-river), (point-of-view in the poem)

[heaven] see Monastery

[nature] see Night

## LUO/SET

[fall]

anchor, frost; sleep

[motion] see River

[end]

night, anchor, frost-season, sleep,

monastery—retire, bell; reaches;

full—complete; midnight; facing—

toward

[setting moon] see Fire

## TI/CAW

[crying] see Sad

[sound] see Bell

[harsh—raucous] see Frost

## MAN/FULL

[spatial] see Sky

[complete] see Moon

see Set

## JIANG/RIVER

[water] see Anchor

[flow] \*see Night

set, fisher—fishing, fire; reaches;

(point-of-view in last lines)

[between banks]

bridge, moon-set-horizon, facing-opposite, monastery-outside-city-walls, mid-night, bell-boat (opposition relations mentioned)

## FENG/MAPLE

see above

## HUO/FIRE

[burn] \*see Anchor

see Frost

[torch-light]

moon; maple, bridge; night, set-horizon, (crow), frost, sky, river, maple, fisher, Gu Su, city, Cold Mountain, monastery, bell, night (all visual data); (full-relation, facing-relation, reaches-relation); traveller, boat (possible visual data); \*sleep

[yellow]

setting-moon, maples; (monastery)

[flame-shape]

maple, maple; mountain; (bell)

[flicker]

caws, frost; bell-reverberation; (waves); anxiety-sad; (maples Sc. in firelight)

[of passion] see Sad

[crackling] see Bell

## YU/FISHER

[to fish]

fire, anchor, boat; river

[labor]

\*night; reaches—attains; anchor; monastery

[human]

bridge, anchor; sad, sleep; Gu Su—Soochow, city, Han-shan Monastery, monastery; bell (-striker), traveller, Han-shan; boat

[group]

crows, maples, torches; city, monastery; \*traveller—stranger

[water] see Anchor

[killing] see Sad

[fish]

crow

## DUI/FACING

[opposite] see River

[toward] see Set

[respond to] see Set

[smoke-fumes]

frost-full-air

#### CHOU/SAD

[misery-crying]

caw-mourn, cold-poor; monastery,  
traveller-stranger; \*full

[frustrated] \*see Set

[grief-death]

caw-mourn, sleep, monastery,  
traveller; fisher-killing, night,  
crows, frost-frozen, cold,  
mountains, rivers

[gloomy] see Crow

[depressing] see Anchor

[anxious] see Fire

#### GU SU/SOOCHOW

[canal] see Anchor

[travel] see Anchor

[Wu] not tabulated

#### WAI/OUTSIDE

[beyond]

(spatial relation) anchor-at, moon-  
set-at, maples-at, fishers-over,  
fires-at, sleep-opposite, monastery-  
at, boat-at; bell-at; (crow-at)

[distance] not tabulated (see space  
analysis)

[exile] see Anchor

[foreign] see Anchor

[not inside] not tabulated (see space  
analysis)

#### SHAN/MOUNTAIN

[height] see Moon

[rock] see Bell

#### MIAN/SLEEP

[rest] see Anchor

[dying out] see Set

[lie down] see Set

see Reaches

[home] see Anchor

[eyes closed] \*see Fire

#### CHENG/CITY

[group] see Fisher

[buildings]

bridge, Gu Su, Han-shan Monastery,  
monastery; bell, boat

[activity] not tabulated (see verb  
analysis)

[city walls] see River

[human] see Fisher

#### HAN/COLD

[wintry] see Frost

[touch-temperature] see Sky

[poor] see Frost

#### HAN-SHAN/HAN-SHAN

[historical personage] not tabulated

[monk—hermit] see Monastery

see Anchor

#### HAN-SHAN MONASTERY

[specific temple] (not analyzed)

#### SI/MONASTERY

[building] see City

[Buddhism]

[climb] see Anchor  
 [shape] see Fire  
 [wilderness] see Sad

## YE/NIGHT

see above

## ZHONG/BELL

[iron-metal]  
 mountain-rock  
 [shape] see Fire  
 [sound]  
 caw, sound, fire; (waves); reaches  
 [reverberate] see Fire  
 [time] see Moon  
 [religion] see Monastery

## DAO/REACHES

[end] see Set  
 [arrival] see Anchor  
 [to x] (not tabulated; see spatial  
 analysis)  
 [extension]  
 bridge, (horizon), full, sky, river,  
 Gu Su, Cold Mountain; sleep

## CHUAN/BOAT

[ship]  
 set-drop, river, anchor, fisher,  
 traveller  
 [water] see Anchor  
 [travel] see Anchor  
 [afloat]  
 moon, crow, frost, fisher; sound

(Doctrine, Ritual, Orders, Han-shan;  
 Insubstantiality, Time, Salvation,  
 Passion, Sadness, & c.) (not  
 analyzed further)

[retreat] see Anchor  
 [lodgings] see Anchor  
 [bells] see Bell

## BAN/HALF

[divided] see River  
 [mid] see Set  
 [counting] see Moon

## SHENG/SOUND

[auditory] see Bell  
 [insubstantial]  
 air, frost, caw, fire; night; sad;  
 full, reaches; (\*maple, \*bridge,  
 \*moon, \*crows, \*frost, \*river,  
 \*maples, \*fishers, \*fire, \*Gu Su,  
 \*city, \*Cold Mountain, \*monastery,  
 \*bell, \*traveller, \*boat)

## KE/TRAVELLER

[me]  
 sad, sleep (see narrative analysis)  
 [stranger]  
 midnight-bell, outside  
 [visitor] see Anchor  
 [movement] see Sad  
 \*see Anchor  
 [conveyed]  
 anchor-boat, moon-sky, frost-sky,  
 fisher-river, traveller-boat



I have then in the following charts tried to show what happens to the chains, by indicating similar semantic classes wherever they are true of the corresponding English words. Words which are no longer a part of a chain of associations appear on the lists, but are crossed out; words which have joined the list as a result of an unsimilar English class or have simply been added to the English poem are added, but in CAPITALS. In the second English chart, I have summarized the consequences of neglecting equivalents for eleven of the Chinese words. And in the third English chart, I have tried to understand the effect of the added words (mostly prepositions) on the level of associations.

### Semantic Classes in the English

#### I. Corresponding Units

##### NIGHT

[dark] see Crow  
 [time] see Moon  
 [rest] see Mooring  
 [the natural]  
 maple, moon, crow, frost,  
~~sky~~, ~~river~~, maple-trees,  
 fire, mountain, night;  
 go down, cold, ~~sound~~,  
 SHADOWS; (~~sky-nature~~)

##### MAPLE

[biological] see Crow  
 [shape] see Torch  
 [natural] see Night  
 [season-word] see Frost  
 [overhead] see Moon

##### THE MOON

[overhead]  
 maple, crow, ~~sky~~, THROUGH  
 THE FROST, maple-trees,  
 mountain; night; \*~~set~~,  
 \*GO DOWN  
 [time]  
 night, moon (not so obvious),  
~~set~~ midnight, bell; frost;  
~~reaches~~; ~~monastery~~; ~~traveller~~;  
~~fall~~, RINGING FOR ME; WHILE  
 [white] see Frost  
 [light] see Torch

##### A MOORING

[casting anchor] see Boat  
 [at rest]  
 night, ~~sleep~~, (~~su~~), ~~traveller~~,  
~~monastery~~; HERE IN MY BOAT;  
 \*fisherman, \*moves, \*torch  
 [travel] bridge, moon, GO DOWN,  
~~troubled sleep~~; THROUGH, MOVES,  
 WITH HIS, FROM beyond, FROM;  
 Su-Chou, Cold Mountain, the  
 temple (~~monastery~~), Maple Bridge;  
 HERE, MY BOAT, boat; ~~traveller~~;  
~~reaches~~, beyond; mountain, temple  
 [water]  
 bridge, ~~river~~, fisherman, Su-Chou,  
 boat; \*torch

##### BRIDGE

[across, joining] see ~~river~~  
 I-MOON, CAWS THROUGH-I, I-BELL,  
 BELL-TEMPLE, ME-BOAT, ~~river~~, moon  
 go down (horizon), ~~falling~~, Su-chou-  
 Cold Mountain-temple, midnight,  
 BELL-ME, FISHERMAN-TORCH, MY-BOAT;  
 AND  
 [extension] see Reaches  
 [body of water] see Mooring  
 [travel] see Mooring  
 [construction] see City

##### GO DOWN

[fall]  
 (mooring), frost, ~~sleep~~, UNDER,  
 SHADOWS, FROM TEMPLE ON  
 [motion] see ~~river~~  
 CAWS THROUGH, MOVES, fisherman-  
 fishing, torch; ~~reaches~~; (point-  
 of-view in last lines, EVEN MORE  
 SO), RINGING; \*~~sleep~~  
 [setting moon] see Torch  
 [end]  
~~night~~, ~~mooring~~, ~~frost~~, ~~sleep~~,  
~~monastery~~, bell; ~~reaches~~, ~~fall~~;  
~~midnight~~; ~~falling~~  
 [DECLINE-TOWARD]  
 FROST-SEASON, SHADOWS-OF, FROM  
 BEYOND, RINGING, FROM ON  
 [EXIT-ENTER] See Through

## A CROW

[biological]  
 maple, fisherman, maple-trees,  
~~traveller~~; Han-shan  
 [SINGLE FIGURE] see A Fisherman  
 [dark-black]  
 night, ~~sea~~; sky; \*moon,\*torch;  
 SHADOWS, MIDNIGHT  
 [overhead] see Moon

## CAVS

[~~er~~ying] see Sad  
 [sound] see Bell  
 [harsh-raucous] see Frost

## THE FROST

[white]  
 moon, cold-winty \*night  
 [harsh]  
 caws, torch, cold  
 [cold] see Sky  
~~air-weather~~, cold; night,  
 midnight; SHADOWS; \*torch  
 [season]  
 maple, crow, sky, fisher,  
~~fires~~, ~~sea~~; cold; ~~bell-sound~~  
 [SNOW]  
 COLD

## MAPLE-TREES

see above  
 [group] see Fisher

## A FISHERMAN

[SINGLE FIGURE]  
 A CROW, (THE TEMPLE)  
 [to fish]  
 torch, mooring, boat;  
~~river~~  
 [labor]  
 \*sleep; mooring; ~~monastery~~;  
~~reaches~~; RINGING  
 [human]  
 bridge, mooring; ~~sea~~, ~~sleep~~;  
 Su-chou, city, Han-shan  
 Monastery, temple; ringing,  
~~traveller~~, Han-shan; boat;  
 I, I, HIS, ME, MY; WATCH.  
 HEAR  
 [group]  
~~er~~ews, maples, ~~ter~~ehes,  
 (city), ~~monastery~~; \*traveller  
 [water] see Mooring  
 [killing] see Sad  
 [fish]  
 crow

## TORCH (less than FIRE)

[burn] \*see Mooring  
 see Frost  
 [light] see also Watch  
 moon; maple, bridge, night, ~~go~~  
~~down~~; (a crow), frost, sky, SHADOWS,  
 maple-trees, ~~river~~, fisherman, Su-  
 chou, city, COLD MOUNTAIN (definitely  
 a real hill now), temple, night, boat.  
 bell (all visual data); ~~traveller~~;  
 (full-relation, facing-relation,  
~~reaches-relation~~); \*sleep  
 [yellow]  
~~setting-moon~~, maple, maples;  
 (monastery)  
 [flame-shape]  
 maple, maples; mountain; (bell)  
 [flicker]  
 caws, frost, SHADOWS, RINGING,  
~~sound-reverberation~~; (wavee);  
~~sea~~; (maples &c. in firelight)  
 [of passion] see Sad  
 [crackling] see Bell  
 [smoke-fumes]  
 through the frost; (NAMING OF TWO  
 SENSES IN POEM)  
 [STICK]  
 MAPLE, MAPLE-TREES  
 [GRASP]  
 MOORING, WITH, RINGING (ROPE)

## BEYOND

[spatial relation] see also Near  
 mooring-at; moon-set-at, maples  
 -at, fishers UNDER; torch-with;  
~~sleep-opposite~~, temple-on, boat  
 -on, bell-at; ME IN BOAT  
 [distance]  
 MOUNTAIN IS BEYOND SU-CHOU,  
 TEMPLE IS ON MOUNTAIN, BELL IS  
 AT TEMPLE, I IS THIS SIDE OF  
 SU-CHOU (see also spatial analysis)  
 [exile] see Mooring  
 [foreign] see Mooring  
 [not inside] not tabulated (see  
 space analysis)  
 [THE INFINITE]  
 TEMPLE

## SU-CHOU

[~~canal~~] see Anchor  
 [travel] see Mooring  
 [wa]

## COLD MOUNTAIN

[historical personage]  
 [monk-hermit] see Monastery  
 see Mooring  
 [TR.VEL] see Mooring

## COLD

[wintry] see Frost  
 [touch-temperature] see Frost  
 [peer] see Frost  
 [INDIFFERENT] see Frost

## MIDNIGHT (less ambiguous)

[dark, &c.] see Night above  
 [divided] see Bridge  
 [mid] see Set  
 [counting] see Moon  
 [GHOSTS] See Shadows

## THE BELL

[iron-metal]  
 mountain-rock  
 [shape] see Torch  
 [sound]  
 caws, sound; torch;  
 (waves); reaches; HEAR;  
 RINGING, BELL-SOUND  
 [reverberate] see Torch  
 [time] see Moon  
 see Ringing  
 [religion] see Monastery  
 RINGING FOR ME, TEMPLE

## MOUNTAIN

[height] see Moon  
 [rock] see Bell  
 [climb] see Mooring  
 [shape] see Torch  
 [wilderness] see Sea  
 see Mooring

## BOAT

[ship] mooring, GO DOWN, set-deep,  
 river, fisherman, traveller  
 [water] see Mooring  
 [travel] see Mooring  
 [afloat]  
 moon, crow, frost, fisher(?);  
 sound  
 [POWER] see EGO

## II. Lost Units

## HAN/FULL

[spatial] see SI  
 [complete] see MOON  
 see Set

## JIANG/RIVER

[water] see Mooring  
 [flow] \*see Night  
 see Go Down  
 [between] see Bridge

## CHOU/SAD

[misery-crying]  
 saw-mourn, sold-peer;  
 monastery, traveller-  
 stranger; \*full  
 [frustrated] \*see Set  
 [grief-death] see RINGING  
 saw-mourn, sleep, monastery,  
 traveller; fisher-kill,  
 night, crows, frost-frozen,  
 cold, mountains, rivers  
 [gloomy] see Crow  
 [depressing] see Mooring  
 [anxious] see Torch

## CHENG/CITY

[group] see Fisherman  
 [buildings]  
 bridge, Su-chou, Han-  
 shan Monastery, monastery,  
 TEMPLE; bell, boat  
 [activity] not tabulated  
 [city walls] see River  
 [human] see Fisherman

## TIAN/SKY-AIR

[temperature] see Frost  
 [overhead] see Moon  
 [spatial] see NEAR  
 full; (objects with background,  
 e.g., FISHERMEN UNDER SHADOWS);  
 (point-of-view in the poem)

## DUI/FACING

[opposite] see Bridge  
 [toward] see Go Down  
 [respond to] see Go Down

## MIAN/SLEEP

[rest] see Mooring  
 [dying out] see Go Down  
 [lie down] see Go Down, see Reaches  
 [home] see Mooring  
 [eyes closed] \*see Torch

## SI/MONASTERY

[building] see City  
 [Buddhism] (probably not present  
 in English, except vaguely)  
 [retreat] see Mooring  
 [lodgings] see Mooring  
 [bells] see Bell

**SHANG/SOUND**

[auditory] see Bell  
 [insubstantial]  
 air, frost, caw, fire, SHADOWS,  
 night; sad; full, reaches,  
 RIDGING, MIDNIGHT; (\*maple,  
 \*bridge, \*moon, \*crow, \*frost,  
 \*river, \*maple-trees, \*fisher,  
 \*torch, \*Su-chou, \*city, \*Cold  
 Mountain, \*monastery, \*TEMPLE,  
 \*bell, \*boat, \*traveller, \*ME)

**DAO/REACHES**

[end] see Go Down  
 [arrival] see Mooring  
 [to x] not tabulated  
 [extension]  
 bridge, (horizon), full,  
 sky, river, (Su-chou),  
 Cold Mountain; sleep

**ME/TRAVELLER**

[me] see I  
 sad, sleep  
 [stranger]  
 midnight-bell, outside  
 [visitor] see Anchor  
 [movement] see Sad  
 \*see Mooring  
 [conveyed] see THROUGH  
 anchor-boat, moon-sky, frost-air,  
 fisher-river, traveller-boat,  
 ME-BOAT, TEMPLE-MOUNTAIN,  
 TORCH-FISHERMAN, CAWS-FROST

## III. Added Unit

**NEAR**

[location in space] (see Beyond)  
 UNDER, WITH, BEYOND, HERE,  
 THROUGH, ON  
 [closeness]  
 UNDER, WITH, HIS, I, I, ME  
 MY, IN; OF; WHILE; \*FROM  
 BEYOND  
 [refuge] see Mooring  
 UNDER, FOR ME, IN MY, HIS  
 TEMPLE

**WHILE**

[time] see Moon  
 [during]  
 WATCH, HEAR, AND  
 [inside] see THROUGH  
 [waiting]  
 WATCH, mooring, MIDNIGHT BELL;  
 \*MOVES

**I**

[the writer]  
 (poem-as-object), I, ME, MY,  
 HERE  
 [specifier]  
 A, A, A; THE, THE, THE, THE;  
 I, ME, MY; HIS; HERE; Su-chou;  
 Cold Mountain  
 [ego]  
 I, ME, MY, HERE, HIS; WATCH,  
 HEAR

**WATCH**

[see] see Torch (visual data)  
 [contemplate]  
 (TEMPLE), (refers back to poem  
 as a whole), (refers back to  
 calculation of distances in last  
 lines)  
 [waiting] see WHILE  
 [supervise]  
 RINGING FOR ME  
 [a sense] see HEAR

**THROUGH**

[internal]  
 WHILE, UNDER; WATCH, HEAR; IN;  
 MIDNIGHT  
 [exit/enter]  
 go down, FROM BEYOND, FROM  
 [by means of]  
 UNDER, OF, WITH, (FOR)  
 [across]  
 Bridge, go down, MOVES UNDER,  
 (moving point-of-view in last  
 lines)  
 [because of]  
 OF, HEAR-RINGING, BELL-MIDNIGHT

**UNDER**

[below]  
 I-MOON, SHADOWS, I-MOUNTAIN,  
 Su-chou-Mountain  
 [subject to]  
 boat-mooring, caws-THROUGH,  
 MOVES WITH, HEAR-BELL; HIS, ME;  
 FROM: OF  
 [inner, hidden]  
 go down, (night), a crow (where?),  
 SHADOWS, beyond, IN, bell-hollow

## THE SHADOWS OF

- [dark] see Crow
- [flicker] see Torch
- [from off body]
  - mooring, caws, WITH, HIS,
  - FROM, FROM, RINGING, MY
- [ghosts]
  - night, WATCH, (moon), (caws),
  - (the beyond), TEMPLE, cold,
  - RINGING FOR ME, MIDNIGHT
- [obscure]
  - night, frost-through, HEAR
  - FROM BEYOND
- [follow]
  - night, MOVES WITH, beyond,
- [silhouette]
  - night, moon, crow

## HIS

- [ego] see I
- [masculine] see Fisher
- [possession]
  - OF, FOR, MY; \*mooring
- [subject to] see UNDER

## HEAR

- [auditory] see Bell
- [contemplate] see WATCH
- [register]
  - WATCH, (poem as a whole)
- [a sense]
  - WATCH, RINGING

## THE TEMPLE

- [building] see City
- [religion] (Chinese religions?),
  - RINGING FOR ME, BELL
  - (numerous distracting associa-
  - tions)
- [priests]
  - bell, FOR ME

## RINGING

- [auditory] see Bell
- [reverberation] see Torch
- [clocked]
  - WHILE, WATCH, MIDNIGHT, bell
- [alarum]
  - caws, MOVES, HEAR, bell
- [celebrating]
  - FOR, TEMPLE

## IN

- see THROUGH, ON, UNDER, OF, UNDER

## WITH

- [adjacent]
  - NEAR, UNDER, OF, AND, ON, IN,
  - HERE
- [by means of] see THROUGH
- [bearing] see UNDER
- [parallel] AND, (there-)HERE,
- (see parallelism analysis)

## AND

- [parallel] see WITH
- [adjacent] see WITH
- [plus]
  - RINGING (several times), (see
  - analysis of repetition)
- [attention particle]
  - WHILE, (use of punctuation)
- [connection to] see Bridge

## FROM

- [out of] see THROUGH
- [because of] see THROUGH
- [apart] see Facing
- [beginning at] see SHADOWS
- \*FOR-DIRECTED TO
- [subject to] see UNDER

## ON

- [above] see Moon
- [supported by]
  - mooring, bridge, THROUGH;
  - WITH, IN, boat
- [at the side of] see WITH

## ME

- see I above

## MY

- see I, HIS above

## HERE

- see I above (also spatial analysis)

Hardly any of the association chains disappear altogether, but certain themes (time, ending, sadness, the insubstantial, a Buddhist flavoring) have been severely curtailed in their impact, while a sense of poetic ego, a mathematical obsession, and a flavor of John Donne ("ringing for me, the midnight bell") appear to have been introduced into the poem.

Perhaps a more typical format for critical awareness of the inner structure of a lyric can be found in the hunt for logical and metaphoric figures. In this poem, however, there are few logical or comparative devices. Only the puzzling 對 *duì* (facing, toward, responds-to, etc.) in the second line has even the flavor of comparison in the Chinese; while in the English, “through the frost” in the first line *may* be taken as metaphoric description of the path of a crow through the air, permeated with frost. On conventional grounds, grammatical parallelism produces a kind of implicit comparison between the two lines of a Chinese couplet, and, traditionally also, between the first and second couplet. Bynner makes the two halves of the poem explicitly parallel: “While I...And I...” As we shall see, this method of joining transforms the parallel from one of situations to one of personal history.

The poem’s existence as a sequence, however, depends crucially on the final level, the level of narrative. I believe that creation of a continuous narrative requires attention to three kinds of imagination: extensional, temporal, and sensitive. One cannot really talk in a precise fashion about the sequential organization of a discourse until one has broken it down into its spatial, its chronological, and its sensory dimensions. Even in a four-line lyric, I think we have all three dimensions present.

First of all, the sensory: we are asking questions about the narrator, about the “implied poet.” What sort of data is he sensitive to? How wide a range does he cover? What degree of focus does he give to the data? Is there continuity in the data? Does he make himself an object of scrutiny? Bynner’s poem suggests a sensitivity to sight, sound, temperature, touch, and perhaps smell. His narrator is highly sensitive to the relationship of objects, both in space and time: *a* crow, *maple-trees*, *a* fisherman, *his* torch, *the* temple *on*, *my* boat, *the* bell; *while* I watch, *and* I hear. This close range and focus continues even in the third line, where the narrative transfers itself to the other side of Soochow, tracking down imaginatively the source of the bell sound in the temple on Cold Mountain. Not only is there direct awareness of the temple so far away from himself as character, but the narrator speaks of the bell as ringing *for* himself (“ringing for me”), either a symbolic assertion by the narrator or a report of the way it seemed to him at that moment. In the last two lines, via the reversed grammar, the narrative makes leaps back and forth between the self in the boat and the distant Cold Mountain Temple. The last line is insistent about the location of the self: “me, here in my boat.” It almost declares that the poem is written simultaneously with the experience, a kind of spontaneous composition (“*here* in my boat”). The self-descriptive phrases of lines one and three (“I watch,” “I hear”) reinforce our notion of divided inner mentality and of simultaneous composition. One might ask whether the self described is aware, as is the poet, that a crow is cawing, that a fisherman

moves with a torch under the maple-trees. We have, however, the option of taking this as narrated consciousness, at least through line two. This option makes the shift in perspective over Soochow to the temple all the more obvious, and so the speculative character of "ringing for me" calls attention to the personality of the self listening to it (gratefully? apprehensively?), to some unspoken knowledge of a pre-arrangement perhaps, or to some allusive quality of bell-symbolism. I think this is why we are forced to recall Donne and "for whom the bell tolls."

The range of the original is also close, but it does not have to commit itself as to the number or the position of things: crow/crows, maple/maples, fisher/fishers, fire/fires; river-maple, fisher-fire. Its insistence falls on the symbolism of names: *Gu Su*, *Han-shan*, *Feng Qiao*, not inappropriate to a traveller's poem. At least we assume that the traveller mentioned briefly near the end is to be identified with a self of the implied poet. This self—this hint of a self—is very small in the poem, yet we get the feeling that the whole of the lyric is narrated consciousness, almost a stream of feelings ("sad sleep"), names, and impressions that a weary traveller might experience at one time. There is no straining of the imagination, as in the English version, to look across the walls of Soochow. There is only a real or a mental glance in the direction of the nearby city, a simultaneous realization of the sound and the source of the sound, the monastery known as the Han-shan monastery, near the canal. The spatial range is in the near distance, the time range is flexible but also capable of a small limitation. And instead of Bynner's rapid shifts of point-of-view, there seems to be a slow close-in on the small witness in the boat in the last lines of the poem. But the most advantageous quality of the narration in the Chinese is that it can be taken as poetic imagination, as a narration of the content of a conscious mind, or as the narration of an inner monologue mixed with the inner objects of that monologue; it can be taken as simultaneous present, as narrated memory, or as reconstructed past, even as a collage of memories and imaginations. The peculiar quality of suggestiveness may reside in this combination of vivid sense data and ambiguous narrative distance.

One must similarly explore the relations of things in space and in time; the result is to see how the Bynner version, unlike the Chinese, insists on placing everything for the reader. The very lack of enumeration in the Chinese underlies the feeling of reverberating sounds and lights that leads ultimately to the echo at the end. And the freedom from grammatically explicit relations keeps each new object ready for a number of possible ways of fitting into the existing context. In exploring the space and time dimensions of the narrative, I have tried to see in what ways the earlier context limits and defines the meaning of new terms. The overall effect in the Chinese was a series of eruptions, an impression of instability and strangeness; in the English, the same pervading night gives the effect

of the ominous, partially through the self-conscious nervousness of the traveller, partially through the definite but unaccounted-for relation of the actions observed.

One might outline the framework of the sequences thus, superimposing one sequence on the other (Chart 7).

Chart 7.

SEQUENTIAL Superimposition of Equivalent Words:			a	b	c	d	e	f					
				MAPLE FENG	BRIDGE QIAO		NIGHT YE	ANCHOR FO					
				Night	Mooring		Maple	Bridge					
1	2	3	4	5 MOON YUE	6 SET LUO	7	8	9 CROW WU	10 CAW TI	11	12	13 FROST SHUANG	
				Moon	Go	Down		Crow	Caws			Frost	
14	15	16	17	18 MAPLE FENG	19	20	21 FISHER YU	22	23	24	25 TREE HUO	26	
				Maple	Trees		Fisherman				Tree		
28	29	30	31	32 GU GU	33 SU SU	34 OUTSIDE WAI	35	36 HAN HAN	37 SHAN SHAN	38 MONASTERY SI	39		
				Beyond	Su	Clow		Temple			Cold	Mountain	
42	43 NIGHT YE	44 MID BAN	45 BELL ZHONG	46 SOUND SHENG	47 REACHES DAO	48 TRAVELLER KE	49 BOAT CHUAN	50	51	52	53	54	
	Midnight			Here		My	Boat						

This shows that, while Bynner has followed the order of images fairly well in three of the lines, in the last, the emphasis given to the final word (by its position and the grammar) has been transferred from "traveller" and "boat" to "midnight bell" itself, leaving us with suggestions of sound, clock, and leaving us suspended between the listening man and the great bell far away on Cold Mountain.

The last experiment on these poems was to try to find a way of comparing the relative impact of the images or words in the two poems. I chose to arbitrarily assign points on the basis of participation in any kind of pattern or on its position in the various sequences composing the poem: the totals do not represent the importance of these words in the poem as a whole, but they can demonstrate a means of separating less from more important terms.

Statistical Prominence of Units

(In grammatical and prosodic junctures, key sequential positions, and in prosodic and semantic patterns.)

One point was assigned for each appearance in an important prosodic or semantic



pattern, for adjacency to an important prosodic or grammatical juncture, and for occupying a key place in a spatial or temporal sequence. In both Chinese and English prosody analysis, an attempt was made to reduce the significance of ordinary prominence of certain units in any kind of written discourse.)

## ZHANG JI

a	13	1	20 月	8	28 江	15	15	22	20 夜
b	12	2	16	9	14	16	11	23	10
c	16	3	15	10	27 漁	17	11	24	19 鐘
d	13	4	11	11	23 火	18	13	25	9
		5	23 霜	12	11	19	19 寒	26	15
		6	12	13	13	20	16	27	15
		7	22 天	14	19 眠	21	21 寺	28	16

## BYNNER &amp; KIANG

a	5	1	16	14	20 under	26	15	39	29 ringing
b	20 night	2	13	15	3	27	10	40	13
c	23 mooring	3	17	16	20 shadows	28	18	41	18
d	5	4	5	17	11	29	16	42	14
e	12	5	25 moon	18	14	30	18	43	14
f	12	6	19	19	11	31	5	44	12
		7	23 down	20	5	32	9	45	14
		8	6	21	16	33	14	46	4
		9	18	22	16	34	3	47	22 midnight
		10	13	23	16	35	16	48	26 bell
		11	16	24	10	36	10		
		12	3	25	22 torch	37	11		
		13	25 frost			38	19		

To go any further than this would require a system of deciding whether prosody or grammatical form or chains of association or visual design or effects of a certain ideological or rhetorical class were the most significant in universal human aesthetics. I don't think this can be done, at the present state of knowledge. One can see the great variety of possible expressions in the collection of European translations which follows:

## Versions of "Night Anchor, Maple Bridge"

W. J. B. Fletcher

## ANCHORED BY NIGHT

The failing of the moonlight the cawing crow awakes,  
 And glitters all the sky above with shining frosty flakes.  
 The maples on the river bank, the lamps the fishers bear.

Cast gloomy shadows through the night that vex our rest with care.  
 From yonder Chill Hill Temple by Soochow's ancient town  
 The sudden booming of the bell, the midnight calling down,  
 Comes with a clang that startles our ship-borne comrades' ears.  
 Imagination's pulses beat quick with shadowy fears.

Witter Bynner

A NIGHT-MOORING NEAR MAPLE BRIDGE

While I watch the moon go down, a crow caws through the frost;  
 Under the shadows of maple-trees a fisherman moves with his torch;  
 And I hear, from beyond Su-chou, from the temple on Cold Mountain,  
 Ringing for me, here in my boat, the midnight bell.

C. W. Luh

The moon goes down, a raven cries, frost fills the sky.  
 River maples, fishing lanterns, —facing sadness I lie.  
 Outside of Ku Su City is the Han Shan Temple.  
 At midnight a bell rings; it reaches the traveller's boat.

Soames Jenyns

*At Anchor in the Night by the Maple Bridge<sup>2</sup>*

The moon sets, the crows caw, hoar frost is in the air,  
 By the maples at the riverside twinkles the light of the fishermen's boats as I  
 take my troubled rest.  
 Outside the city of Soochow stands the Han Shan Monastery  
 And at midnight there comes to me in my boat the tolling of the temple bell.

Ts'ai T'ing-kan

Anchored At Night By The Maple Bridge

The moon is setting, rooks disturb the frosty air,  
 I watch by mapled banks the fishing-torches flare.  
 Outside the Suchow walls, from Han-shan Temple's bell,  
 I hear its sound aboard and feel its midnight spell.

Tchang Fou-jouei & Yves Hervouet

NUIT À L'ANCRE  
 AU PONT DES ÉRABLES<sup>1</sup>

La lune se couche, un corbeau croasse, le gel emplit le ciel;  
 Les érables du fleuve et les feux des pêcheurs font face à mon triste  
 [sommeil.  
 Du monastère de la Montagne froide, hors des murs de Kou-sou,  
 Le son d'une cloche, à minuit, parvient jusqu'au bateau du voyageur.

Manfred Hausmann

*AN DER AHORNBRÜCKE*

*Die Nacht hat Nebel auf den Strom gehaucht,  
in den der halbe Mond verdämmernd taucht.  
Von einem Feuer, das am Ufer loht,  
fällt Flackerlicht in mein verdecktes Boot.  
Ich schlafe nicht. Gescheuchte Krähen schrein.  
Es kann nicht weit bis Mitternacht mehr sein.  
Vom Felsenkloster hinter Gu-su summt  
ein Glockenton herüber und verstummt.*

Yang & Yang

As the moon sets, crows caw under a frosty sky;  
Near the maples and fishermen's fires my sleep is troubled;  
And the toll of midnight bells from Hanshan Temple  
Reaches the traveller's boat.

David Hughes

ANCHORING AT NIGHT BY THE MAPLE BRIDGE

by Chang Chi (circa 756)

The moon is setting, the crows crying and the dawn sky is  
frosty.  
The river maples and the fishing lamps are quiet in sorrow.  
The sound of the bell in Cold Mountain Temple outside Ku-Su  
City  
Arrives at the traveler's boat at midnight.

Giuliano Bertuccioli

Ancoraggio di notte al ponte degli aceri

La luna tramonta, i corvi gracchiano,  
la brina si diffonde nel cielo.  
Gli aceri lungo il fiume, i fuochi dei piscatori  
sono dinanzi a me, che tristemente riposo.  
Fuori dalle mura della città di Su-chou,  
dal Tempio di Han-shan,  
a mezzanotte un suono di campana  
giunge fino alla barca del viaggiatore.

Richard Wilhelm

An der Ahornbrücke bei Nacht vor Anker

Der Mond ist längst hinunter.  
 Nur Raben sind noch munter.  
 Der kalte Reif vom Himmel fällt.  
 Am Fluss der Ahorn dunkelt,  
 Der Fischer Feuer funkelt,  
 Ich bin allein auf weiter Welt.  
 Fern ruht die Stadt in Tale,  
 Da tönt mit einem Male  
 Vom Berg die Kloster glocke schon  
 Die Mitternacht, verklingend  
 Und übers Wasser schwingend  
 Vernimmt der Pilgrim diesen Ton.

夜  
半  
鐘  
聲  
到  
客  
船

姑  
蘇  
城  
外  
寒  
山  
寺

江  
楓  
漁  
火  
對  
愁  
眠

月  
落  
烏  
啼  
霜  
滿  
天

張  
繼

楓  
橋  
夜  
泊

HALF-  
NIGHT  
BELL  
SOUND  
REACHES  
TRAVELLER  
BOAT

SOO  
CHOW  
CITY  
OUTSIDE  
COLD  
MOUNTAIN  
MONASTERY

RIVER  
MAPLE  
FISHER  
FIRE  
FACING  
SAD  
SLEEP

MOON  
SET  
CROW  
CAW  
FROST  
FULL  
AIR

Zhang  
Ji

Maple  
Bridge  
Night  
Anchor

Fēng Qiáo Yè Pó

Yuè lò wū tí shuāng mǎn tiān  
 Jiāng fēng yú huǒ duì chóu mián  
 Gū Sū Chéng wài Hán Shān sì  
 Yè bàn zhōng shēng dào kè chuán  
 Zhāng Jì

NOTES

1. *The Jade Mountain*, New York, 1929.
2. I have followed the suggestions of Bernhard Karlgren (*Analytic Dictionary*, etc.) and R. A. D. Forrest (*The Chinese Language*).
3. *The Structure of Language*, New Jersey, 1964.

# 英釋“楓橋夜泊”評譯

孔 亞 聖

詩歌之繙譯，尤其從亞洲文字譯成西方文字，問題繁多，而對於繙譯作品之優劣，尤不易作一公平之估價。讀者往往以個人成見及嗜好，任意批評譯文，或提出詩歌根本不能繙譯之論調。作者鑒於最近西方文學雜誌內，不時登載中、日詩之譯文或模倣作品，因此提供一種繙譯批評方法之新嘗試，以期樹立較為客觀之譯評標準。本文從語言學及詩學觀點，如音調，韻律，文法，字義，視覺，圖像，敘述，主題等方面，並以表格式樣，詳細分析及比較唐、張繼“楓橋夜泊”一詩之原文，與Bynner（美詩人）及江亢虎合作之英文繙譯。凡中、英文字與詩歌格調之不同處中詩英譯時之種種問題，均因此實例而益見彰明，而譯文之優點及弱點，亦可不言而喻矣。文後並附其他中、英、法、德、意各家之同一原詩之各種譯文。